FISEVIER

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Annals of Medicine and Surgery

journal homepage: www.annalsjournal.com



Peer Review Report

Peer review report 1 on "A Clinical and Ethical Review on Late Results and Benefit after Evar"

Original Submission

Recommendation

Minor Revision

Comments to the author

What a splendid paper! Very thought provoking and comprehensive, possibly opening a Pandora's box around the question of informed consent, litigation and the availability of procedures not every surgical receiving unit necessarily has access to both EVAR and open aneurysm repair, or to current outcome data. How many EVAR centres are there in Italy? How long does a doctor spend discussing the options and possible complications in the detail that you recommend?

Is there a chance of scrupulous proof reading, and possibly shortening the paper a little, especially the discussion of the ethics of consent? It would read better if close attention is paid to singular and plurals, and the definite and indefinite articles. For instance, in my opinion your Highlights could be modified as follows:

Highlights

* The long term results after endovascular repair (EVAR) for abdominal aortic aneurysms (AAA) are still considered one of the main limitations of this treatment option

- * This paper is a comprehensive review of the current literature on long-term mortality after EVAR procedures
- * We report, for the first time, an analysis of informed consent from a non-surgical point of view, with particular regard to the ethical and medico-legal implications of the indications for intervention.

Critical proof reading could be helpful over style also: for instance, in the sentence 'The aim of this review was to assess whether or not late mortality after EVAR is a real problem, and whether it could be an issue in the case of medical litigation' you could delete 'or not' as this is implicit in the use of the word 'whether'. 'That's particularly true' is a little too colloquial for a scientific paper. I suggest 'That is ...'. And so on.

I am not clear what you mean by "So, in this regard, the probability of a binding postoperative course must be mentioned". What is a binding post-operative course?

These are only my personal observations, but I hope they enhance your paper and that it can be published in due course.

Tim Gabe Williams, MA MChir FRCS, Retired Consultant General

ex Spire Tunbridge Wells Hospital, Surgery, Burnt Oak House, Back Lane, Waldron, Heathfield, TN210NN, United Kingdom E-mail address: twill30999@aol.com.